

ATA 59E
COMPARATIVE EMPIRES, POLITICAL ECONOMY, EVERYDAY POLITICS
Nadir Özbek
Fall 2020

Class: Wednesday 10:00-13:00
Classroom [Zoom Meeting](#)
E-mail: nadir.ozbek@gmail.com

Course Description:

The course introduces students to the range of methodologies and theories dealing with empires, modern states, fiscal systems, and comparative history. We start with the discussion of theories of comparison, the problem of temporality, and time-space relationship. We'll specifically concentrate on providing a critique of well-established paradigms of comparison and linear conception of time still informing historiographies of Ottoman and Russian empires, China and Japan. The course aims to provide a critical and alternative ground of comparison for nineteenth-century histories of these societies. The course then proceeds to examination of comparative histories of these societies particularly with a focus on political economy, taxation and fiscal systems. We take taxation and fiscal systems not merely as institutional consolidations, but rather administrative practices and politics in the everyday realm. A focus on everyday will help us overcome an abstract conception of modernity and formulate a new ground for comparative history which will have room for historical differences within their shared context of global political economy of modern capitalism.

Course Requirements:

During the semester we are going to make common readings as the basis for our weekly discussions. Attendance and class participation is mandatory, unexcused absence will lower your grade. Participation and contribution to class discussions count 50%. You are expected to write a 2000-word review essay examining a group of books and articles in any geographic area that deals with the course themes. 50%.

Note: Pieces with * are optional readings.

Course Schedule:

Week I: Introduction to the Course

Week II: The Question of Comparability I

Cheah, Pheng. "Grounds of Comparison." In *Ground of Comparison: Around the Work of Benedict Anderson*, edited by Pheng Cheah and Jonathan Culler, 1-20. London: Routledge, 2003.

Harootunian, Harry. "Ghostly Comparisons: Anderson's Telescope." In *Ground of Comparison: Around the Work of Benedict Anderson*, edited by Pheng Cheah and Jonathan Culler, 171-90. London: Routledge, 2003.

* Goswami, Manu. "Autonomy and Comparability: Notes on the Anticolonial and the Postcolonial." *boundary 2* 32, no. 2 (2005): 201-25.

Week III: The Question of Comparability II

Chatterjee, Partha. "Anderson's Utopia." In *Ground of Comparison: Around the Work of Benedict Anderson*, edited by Pheng Cheah and Jonathan Culler, 161-70. London: Routledge, 2003.

Anderson, Benedict. "Responses." In *Ground of Comparison: Around the Work of Benedict Anderson*, edited by Pheng Cheah and Jonathan Culler, 225-46. London: Routledge, 2003.

* Steinmetz, George. "Comparative History and Its Critics: A Genealogy and a Possible Solution." In *A Companion to Global Historical Thought*, edited by Prasenjit Duara, Viren Murthy and Andrew Sartori, 412-36. West Sussex: Wiley Blackwell, 2014.

Week IV: Comparative Political Economy of Modern States:

Pomeranz, Kenneth. "Comparisons, Connections, and Narratives of European Economic Development." In *The Great Divergence: China, Europe and the Making of the Modern World Economy*, 1-27. Princeton: Princeton University Press, 2000.

O'Brien, Patrick. "Ten Years of Debate on the Origins of the Great Divergence, (review no. 1008)." *Reviews in History* (12 September, 2009).

* Rosenthal, Jean-Laurent, and Roy Bin Wong. *Before and Beyond Divergence: The Politics of Economic Change in China and Europe*. Cambridge, Massachusetts: Harvard University Press, 2011. (pp. 1-11, 12-34, 228-242).

Week V: Comparative Empires and Shared Histories of Modernity

İslamoğlu, Huri, and Peter C. Perdue. "Introduction." In *Shared Histories of Modernity: China, India and the Ottoman Empire*, edited by Huricihan İslamoğlu and Peter C. Perdue, 1-20. Oxon: Routledge, 2009.

Subrahmanyam, Sanjay. "The Fate of Empires: Rethinking Mughals, Ottomans and Habsburgs." In *Shared Histories of Modernity: China, India and the Ottoman Empire*, 74-108. Oxon: Routledge, 2009.

* Perdue, Peter C. "Empire and Nation in Comparative Perspective: Frontier Administration in Eighteenth-Century China." In *Shared Histories of Modernity: China, India and the Ottoman Empire*, edited by Huricihan İslamoğlu and Peter C. Perdue, 21-45. Oxon: Routledge, 2009.

* İslamoğlu, Huri. "Modernities Compared: State Transformations and Constitutions of Property in the Qing and Ottoman Empires." In *Shared Histories of Modernity: China, India and the Ottoman Empire*, edited by Huricihan İslamoğlu and Peter C. Perdue, 109-46. Oxon: Routledge, 2009.

Week VI: The Ottoman and Russian Empires in Comparative Perspective: Old and New Paradigms

Barkey, Karen. *Empire of Difference: The Ottomans in Comparative Perspective*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2008. (pp.3-27)

Barkey, Karen, and Mark von Hagen, eds. *After Empire: Multiethnic Societies and Nation-Building: The Soviet Union and Russian, Ottoman, and Habsburg Empires*. Colorado: Westview Press, 1997. (pp.181-190)

* Suny, Ronald Grigor. "Learning from Empire: Russia and the Soviet Union." In *Lessons of Empire: Imperial Histories and American Power*, edited by Craig Calhoun, Frederick Cooper and Kevin W. Moore, 73-93. New York: The New Press, 2006.

* Brisku, Adrian. *Political Reform in the Ottoman and Russian Empires: A Comparative Approach*. London: Bloomsbury, 2017. (pp.1-16; 189-198).

Week VII: Paths Toward Modern Fiscal States: Political and Fiscal Making of the Nineteenth-Century European States

Cardoso, Jose Luis, and Pedro Lains, eds. *Paying for the Liberal State: The Rise of Public Finance in Nineteenth-Century Europe*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2010. (pp.1-26)

Week VIII: Paths Toward Modern Fiscal States: Japan

He, Wenkai. *Paths Toward the Modern Fiscal State: England, Japan and China*. Cambridge, Massachusetts: Harvard University Press, 2013. (pp.1-23, 180-187)

Week IX: Political Economies of China and Europe Compared

Wong, Roy Bin. *China Transformed: Historical Change and the Limits of European Experience*. Ithaca: Cornell University Press, 1997. (Introduction: Beyond European Models of Historical Change, pp.1-7; Chapter 12: Comparative History and Social Theory, pp.277-290)

Week X: Ottoman Path to Modern State Reconsidered I

Yaycıoğlu, Ali *Partners of the Empire: The Crisis of the Ottoman Order in the Age of Revolutions*. Stanford: Stanford University Press, 2016. (pp.1-15)

Salzmann, Ariel. *Tocqueville in the Ottoman Empire: Rival Paths to the Modern State*. Leiden: Brill, 2004. (pp.176-199)

Week XI: Ottoman Path to Modern State Reconsidered II

Karaman, K. Kıvanç, and Şevket Pamuk. "Different Paths to Modern State in Europe: The Interaction Between Warfare, Economic Structure, and Political Regime." *American Political Science Review* 107, no. 3 (2013): 1-24.

Balla, Eliana, and Noel D. Johnson. "Fiscal Crisis and Institutional Change in the Ottoman Empire and France." *The Journal of Economic History* 69, no. 3 (2009): 809-45.

Özbek, Nadir. "Tax Farming in the Nineteenth-Century Ottoman Empire: Institutional Backwardness or the Emergence of Modern Public Finance?" *Journal of Interdisciplinary History* 49, no. 2 (2018): 219-45.

* Karaman, K. Kıvanç, and Şevket Pamuk. "Ottoman State Finances in European Perspective, 1500-1914." *The Journal of Economic History* 70, no. 3 (2010): 593-629.

* Özbek, Nadir. "The Politics of Taxation and the "Armenian Question" during the Late Ottoman Empire, 1876–1908." *Comparative Studies in Society and History* 54, no. 4 (2012): 770-97.

Week XII: The Shifting Time and Space of Comparison in Ottoman Historiography I

Harootyan, Harry. "Some Thoughts on Comparability and the Space-Time Problem." *Boundary* 32, no. 2 (2005): 23-52.

Markiewicz, Christopher. "Europeanist Trends and Islamic Trajectories in Early Modern Ottoman History." *Past & Present*, no. 2, 39 (2018): 265-81.

* Mikhail, Alan, and Christine M Philiou. "The Ottoman Empire and the Imperial Turn." *Comparative Studies in Society and History* 54, no. 4 (2012): 721-45.

Week XIII: The Shifting Time and Space of Comparison in Ottoman Historiography II

Aymes, Marc. *A Provincial History of the Ottoman Empire: Cyprus and the Eastern Mediterranean in the Nineteenth Century*. Translated by Adrian Morfee. London: Routledge, 2014. (pp.1-20)

Hanssen, Jens. "Practices of Integration - Center-Periphery Relations in the Ottoman Empire." In *The Empire in the City: Arab Provincial Capitals in the Late Ottoman Empire*, edited by Jens Hanssen, Thomas Philipp and Stefan Weber, 49-74. Beirut: Ergon Verlag Würzburg In Kommission, 2002.

* Hadjikyricou, Antonis. "Envisioning Insularity in the Ottoman World." *Princeton Papers: Interdisciplinary Journal of Middle Eastern Studies* 18 (2007): vii-xix.

Week XIV: The Limits of the New Institutional Economics: The Question of Comparability Revisited

Daunton, Martin. "Rationality and Institutions: Reflections on Douglass North." *Structural Change and Economic Dynamics* 21, no. 2 (2010): 147-56.

- Pamuk, Şevket. "Economic History, Institutions, and Institutional Change." *International Journal of Middle East Studies* 44 (2012): 532-35.
- Kuran, Timur. "Synergies between Middle Eastern Economic History and the Analytic Social Sciences." *International Journal of Middle East Studies* 44, no. 03 (2012): 542-45.
- * North, Douglass C. *Institutions, Institutional Change, and Economic Performance*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1990. (pp.107-141)
- Acemoglu, D., and S Johson. "Unbounding Institutions." *Journal of Political Economy* 113, no. 5 (2005): 949-95.
- * Acemoglu, Daron, and James A. Robinson. *The Narrow Corridor: States, Societies, and the Fate of Liberty*. New York: Penguin Books Ltd., 2020. (Introduction)